

# DETAILED TABLE OF CONTENTS

FOREWORD BY JUSTICE EILEEN E. GILLESE xxvii

PREFACE xxix

SELECTED LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS xxxiv

CHAPTER 1:  
LEGAL NATURE OF THE PENSION 1

A. Introduction 1

B. Overview 2

- 1) Statistical Overview 2
  - a) Introduction 2
  - b) Plan design type 2
  - c) Recent changes in pension coverage 3
  - d) Geographic concentration 4
  - e) Funding instrument 5
- 2) Thematic Overview 5
  - a) Historical context 5
  - b) A dialectical tension 6
  - c) Diverse interests 8

C. Sources of Law 8

- 1) Introduction 8
- 2) Minimum Standards Legislation 9
  - a) Introduction 9
  - b) Interpretation 9

- 3) Contract Law 11
  - a) Introduction 11
  - b) Interpretation 13
- 4) Equity and Trusts 15
  - a) Introduction 15
  - b) Interpretation 17
- 5) Constitutional Law 20
  - a) Introduction 20
  - b) Paramountcy 20
  - c) Judicial remuneration 22
- 6) *Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms* 23
  - a) Introduction 23
  - b) Section 2(a): freedom of religion 23
  - c) Section 2(d): freedom of association 24
  - d) Section 15: equality rights 25
  - e) Analysis of *Charter* use in the pensions context 27
- 7) Administrative Law 28
  - a) Introduction 28
  - b) The “high duty” principle 29
  - c) Application 29
- 8) Other Legislation 30
  - a) Introduction 30
  - b) *Income Tax Act* 30
  - c) Additional statutes 30
- 9) Policies and Guidelines 32
  - a) Regulatory policy statements 32
  - b) Canadian Association of Pension Supervisory Authorities 33

CHAPTER 2:

FOUNDATIONS 35

A. Introduction 35

B. The Dark Ages 35

- 1) Pre-Twentieth Century 35
  - a) Doctrine of individual responsibility 35
  - b) Early employment plans 36
  - c) *Pension Fund Societies Act* 36
  - d) *The Superannuation Act* 36
- 2) The Interwar Years 37
  - a) Introduction 37
  - b) *Old Age Pensions Act* 37
  - c) Public sector retirement schemes 37
  - d) Employer-sponsored schemes 38
- 3) The Emerging Welfare State 39
  - a) Unionization 39

- b) *Income Tax Act* registration 39
- C. **The Middle Ages** 40
  - 1) Introduction 40
  - 2) Pension Standards Legislation 41
    - a) *Pension Benefits Act, 1962–63* 41
    - b) Canada Pension Plan 41
    - c) Constitutional compromise 42
    - d) *Pension Benefits Act, 1965* 42
    - e) *Supplemental Pension Plans Act, 1965* 43
    - f) Other developments in the 1960s and 1970s 43
  - 3) The Pension Commission of Ontario: 1965–1986 44
    - a) Composition and structure 44
    - b) Statutory decision-making 45
    - c) Hearing rights 46
    - d) The *Collins* decision 48
- D. **The Modern Period** 53
  - 1) Introduction 53
    - a) Pension reform in the early 1980s 54
    - b) The Haley Commission 55
    - c) The Grossman Report 56
    - d) The *Pension Benefits Act, 1987* 56
    - e) Regulation 909 57
  - 2) Proposals for Further Reform 57
    - a) The Friedland Task Force 58
    - b) *Building on Reform* consultation paper 58
    - c) Ontario Law Reform Commission report on family property 59
    - d) Pension reform in other jurisdictions 59
    - e) Income tax reform 59
  - 3) The Pension Commission of Ontario: 1987–1997 60
    - a) Introduction 60
    - b) Superintendent of Pensions 61
    - c) Policy-making responsibility 62
    - d) Adjudicatory responsibility 62
  - 4) Developing an Adjudicatory Foundation 62
    - a) Introduction 62
    - b) Interpreting the minimum standards 63
    - c) Hearing rights 64
    - d) Application of procedural principles 67
- E. **The Present** 70
  - 1) Introduction 70
    - a) Further legislative reform 70
    - b) Further income tax reform 71
  - 2) The Financial Services Commission of Ontario 71

- a) Introduction 71
- b) Regulatory restructuring 72
- c) Decentralization of functions 72
- 3) Judicial Forum 74
  - a) Concurrent jurisdiction of the courts and the PCO 74
  - b) Move away from concurrent jurisdiction 78
  - c) Move back to concurrent jurisdiction 82
  - d) Summary 83
- F. The Future 84**
  - 1) Introduction 84
  - 2) Proposals for Legislative Reform 85
    - a) Introduction 85
    - b) CAPSA Model Law 86
    - c) Immediate vesting 87
    - d) Partial wind-up surplus 87
    - e) Elimination of partial wind-ups 89
    - f) Employer surplus withdrawal 90
    - g) Trust law restrictions on plan design 90
    - h) Deficit funding rules 91
    - i) Pension benefits guarantee fund 92
    - j) Marriage breakdown 92
    - k) Plan governance 93

CHAPTER 3:  
REACH 94

- A. Introduction 95**
- B. Sponsorship 96**
  - 1) Plan Sponsor 96
    - a) Introduction 96
    - b) Employer-sponsored pension plans 96
    - c) Multi-employer pension plans 96
    - d) Jointly sponsored pension plans 98
  - 2) Plan Design 99
    - a) Introduction 99
    - b) Defined benefit pension plans 99
    - c) Defined contribution pension plans 100
    - d) Hybrid pension plans 101
    - e) Flexible pension plans 102
  - 3) Risk Considerations 103
    - a) Introduction 103
    - b) Conventional assumptions 104
    - c) Risk-sharing assumptions 105
    - d) Defined contribution design issues 106

- e) Summary 109
- C. Application 109
  - 1) Introduction 110
  - 2) Applies to a Pension Plan 110
    - a) Must provide pension benefits 110
    - b) Excluded retirement arrangements 112
    - c) Supplementary employee retirement plans 112
  - 3) Applies to Employment 113
    - a) Employee 113
    - b) Employer 114
  - 4) Multi-Jurisdictional Pension Plans 115
    - a) Introduction 115
    - b) Reciprocal agreements 115
    - c) Designated provinces 116
    - d) Judicial consideration 117
    - e) Conflict of laws 119
    - f) Administrator responsibilities 123
- D. Registration 124
  - 1) Registration Under the *Pension Benefits Act* 125
    - a) Introduction 125
    - b) Formal requirements for registration 125
    - c) Non-compliance and revocation of registration 126
  - 2) Registration Under the *Income Tax Act* 127
    - a) Introduction 127
    - b) Formal requirements for registration 127
    - c) Tax advantages of registration 128
    - d) Non-compliance and revocation of registration 128
- E. Statutory Floor 129
  - 1) Greater Rights Principle 130
    - a) Introduction 130
    - b) Regulatory compliance 130
  - 2) Minimum Rights Principle 130
    - a) Introduction 130
    - b) Contracting out 131
    - c) Waiver, release, estoppel, and unjust enrichment 133

## CHAPTER 4: REGULATION 137

- A. Introduction 137
- B. Financial Services Commission of Ontario 137
  - 1) Introduction 137

- 2) FSCO Board 138
  - a) Composition and structure 138
  - b) Statutory functions 138
  - c) Immunity and civil proceedings 139
- 3) Executive Branch of Government 140
  - a) Lieutenant Governor in Council 140
  - b) Minister of Finance 141

**C. Superintendent of Financial Services 141**

- 1) Introduction 141
- 2) Statutory Functions 142
  - a) Decision-making functions 142
  - b) Administrative and procedural functions 144
  - c) Policy-making functions 146
- 3) Enforcement and Adjudication 146
  - a) Duty to investigate 146
  - b) Notice and process 148
  - c) Decision 149
  - d) Reconsideration and *functus officio* 151
  - e) Prosecution 151
- 4) Reach of the Superintendent's Jurisdiction 153
  - a) Introduction 153
  - b) Statutory compliance 155
  - c) Contract interpretation 155
  - d) Trust and fiduciary claims 158
  - e) Removal of administrator 161
  - f) Negligent misrepresentation 161
  - g) Spousal and beneficiary claims 162
  - h) *Charter* remedies 164

**D. Financial Services Tribunal 165**

- 1) Introduction 165
  - a) Overview 165
  - b) Adjudicative mandate 166
- 2) Composition and Structure 166
  - a) Chair and vice-chairs 166
  - b) Members 166
  - c) Registrar and staff 167
- 3) Jurisdiction 167
  - a) Introduction 167
  - b) Notice of Proposal 168
  - c) Request for Hearing 169
  - d) Prematurity 171
  - e) Filing deadlines 172
  - f) Issue estoppel 173
- 4) Scope of the Hearing 174

- a) Hearing *de novo* 174
- b) Deference to the Superintendent 175
- c) Legitimate expectation, delay, and estoppel 177
- d) Superintendent's investigation 177
- 5) Practice and Procedure 178
  - a) *Statutory Powers Procedure Act* 178
  - b) Rules of practice 178
  - c) Appointment of panel 178
  - d) Party status and standing 179
  - e) Pre-hearing conference 181
  - f) Settlement and discontinuance 182
  - g) Notice of hearing 183
  - h) Motions 185
  - i) Disclosure 186
  - j) Interrogatories 188
  - k) Investigations 190
  - l) Witnesses 190
  - m) Evidence 191
  - n) Agreed statements of fact 191
  - o) Experts 192
  - p) Conduct of the hearing 192
  - q) Submissions 194
  - r) Decision 194
  - s) Reconsideration 195
- 6) Costs 196
  - a) Costs payable by a party 197
- 7) Appeal 199
  - a) Final decision of the Tribunal 199
  - b) Appeal procedure 200
  - c) Interveners 200
  - d) Scope of the appeal 201
- 8) Standard of Review 202
  - a) Introduction 202
  - b) Deference to the PCO: 1990–1999 203
  - c) Twilight of PCO decision-making 205
  - d) Deference to the Tribunal: 2000–2006 206

## CHAPTER 5:

## MINIMUM STANDARDS 209

## A. Membership 209

- 1) Introduction 209
- 2) Mandatory or Voluntary Membership 210
  - a) Term of contract of employment 210
  - b) Disclosure and enrolment by plan administrator 211

- c) Voluntary termination of membership 211
  - 3) Plan Design Constraints 212
    - a) Class of employees 212
    - b) Differentiation on the basis of sex 213
    - c) Waiting period 214
  - 4) Employee Disclosure 214
    - a) Introduction 214
    - b) Annual pension statement 215
    - c) Other employee statements 216
    - d) Documentation upon request 216
- B. Vesting and Accrual 217**
  - 1) Introduction 217
    - a) Overview 217
    - b) Background 218
  - 2) Gradual and Uniform Accrual of Benefits 218
    - a) Introduction 218
    - b) Generally 218
    - c) Hour banks and union plans 219
  - 3) Vesting Rules 219
    - a) Ontario rules 219
    - b) Other jurisdictions 221
    - c) Exceptions 223
  - 4) Continuous Accrual 224
    - a) Statutory leave of absence 224
    - b) Layoff and progressive discipline 225
    - c) Disability and workplace injury 226
    - d) Accrual during contractual absence 227
    - e) Suspension of accrual during contractual absence 228
    - f) Past service credit 228
  - 5) Dismissal and Pension Accrual 229
    - a) Introduction 229
    - b) Accrual during statutory notice period 229
    - c) Accrual during common law notice period 230
    - d) Not vested during notice period 232
- C. Locking-in and Portability 232**
  - 1) Introduction 232
    - a) Locking-in 232
    - b) Portability 234
    - c) Commuted value 235
  - 2) The General Rule 236
    - a) Locking-in 236
    - b) No commutation or surrender 236
    - c) Portability 237
    - d) Multi-jurisdictional pension plans 237

- 3) Locked-In Retirement Savings Vehicles 239
  - a) Generally 239
  - b) Locked-In Registered Retirement Savings Plan (LRSP) 240
  - c) Locked-In Retirement Account (LIRA) 241
  - d) Registered Retirement Income Fund (RRIF) 241
  - e) Life Income Fund (LIF) 242
  - f) Locked-In Retirement Income Fund (LRIF) 242
- 4) Other Portability Vehicles 243
  - a) Life annuity 243
  - b) Transfer to another pension plan 243
- 5) Locking-In and Portability Exceptions 244
  - a) Non-vested termination 245
  - b) Immediate pension 246
  - c) Small pension 246
  - d) Early vesting 248
  - e) 50 percent cost-sharing rule 248
  - f) *Income Tax Act* maximum 250
  - g) Non-resident of Canada 250
  - h) Employer assumes all funding obligations 251
  - i) Additional voluntary contributions 251
  - j) Surplus 252
  - k) Sale of a business 252
  - l) Plan deficit 252
  - m) Financial hardship 253
  - n) Shortened life expectancy 254
  - o) Marriage breakdown 255
- 6) Administration 255
  - a) Communication 255
  - b) Discharge 257
- 7) Execution, Seizure, Assignment, and Charge 257
  - a) Generally 257
  - b) Scope of the exemption 258
  - c) Administrator's duties 260
  - d) Judgment creditors 260
  - e) Trustees in bankruptcy 260
  - f) Canada Revenue Agency 261
  - g) Marriage breakdown 262

#### **D. Retirement Benefits 262**

- 1) Introduction 262
  - a) Meaning of retirement 262
  - b) Meaning of pension 263
- 2) Form of Pension 263
  - a) Periodicity 263
  - b) Normal form 264
  - c) Joint and survivor pension 264

- d) Actuarial equivalency 265
- e) Optional forms 266
- 3) Minimum and Maximum Pension 266
  - a) Minimum pension for pre-reform service 267
  - b) Indexing and inflation protection 267
  - c) Ancillary benefits 268
  - d) *Income Tax Act* maximum pension rule 270
- 4) Normal Retirement Date 272
  - a) Introduction 272
  - b) Application and interpretation 272
- 5) Postponed Retirement 273
  - a) Mandatory retirement 273
  - b) Continuation of service 274
- 6) Early Retirement 275
  - a) Actuarial equivalency 275
  - b) Timing of commencement 277
  - c) Enhanced early retirement benefits 278
  - d) Temporary retirement windows and downsizing programs 279
  - e) Design and administration issues 280
  - f) Phased early retirement 281
  - g) Return to work and non-competition clauses 281
  - h) Bridging benefits 282
- 7) Human Rights and Age Discrimination 284
  - a) Introduction 284
  - b) *Bona fide* pension plan requirement 284
  - c) Individual and group rights 285
  - d) The reasonableness test 285
- E. Spouses, Beneficiaries, and Estates 286**
  - 1) Introduction 286
    - a) Overview 286
    - b) The timing of events 287
    - c) The nature of spousal interests 287
    - d) Definition of spouse 288
  - 2) Post-Retirement Death Benefits 290
    - a) Introduction 290
    - b) Overview 290
    - c) Eligibility requirements 290
    - d) Scope of the minimum standard 293
  - 3) Pre-Retirement Death Benefits 294
    - a) Introduction 294
    - b) Death prior to “retirement” 294
    - c) Spousal interests 295
    - d) Designated beneficiaries 295
    - e) Dependent children 298
    - f) Amount of the minimum death benefit 299

- g) Form of payment 300
- h) Administrator's responsibilities 301
- i) Competing beneficiaries 301
- 4) Former Spouses 302
  - a) Introduction 302
  - b) Pensions as family property 303
  - c) Valuation: a matter between the spouses 304
  - d) Equalization settlement approaches 306
  - e) Settlement by direct equalization payment 306
  - f) Settlement by employee trust 307
  - g) Settlement by splitting pension payments at source 307
  - h) Settlement by assignment and credit splitting 308
  - i) Settlement limits in the *PBA* 310
  - j) Settlement by beneficiary designation 312
  - k) Support payments 313

## CHAPTER 6:

## ADMINISTRATION 316

## A. Introduction 316

- 1) Identity of the Administrator 316
  - a) Who may be the administrator 316
  - b) Employee representation 318
  - c) Pensioner representation 322
  - d) The trade-off of joint governance 323
  - e) Advisory committees 325
- 2) Statutory Functions 327
  - a) Generally 327
  - b) Plan design requirements 328
  - c) Specific functions 328

## B. Duty and Standard of Care 330

- 1) Introduction 330
  - a) Statutory duty of care 330
  - b) Common law duty of care 331
  - c) To whom the duty is owed 332
- 2) Content of the Duty 333
  - a) Introduction 333
  - b) Relevant knowledge and skill 334
  - c) Loyalty and good faith 335
  - d) No conflict of interest 336
  - e) Impartiality and even-handedness 341
  - f) Inform and disclose 344
- 3) Discharge and Mitigation 345
  - a) Statutory discharge 345

- b) Overpayment and set-off 347
  - c) Claims to recover losses 348
  - d) Advice and directions 349
- C. Agents and Advisors 352**
- 1) Overview 352
    - a) Introduction 352
    - b) Duty to monitor 353
    - c) Who is an agent 353
    - d) Scope of an agent's duty 354
    - e) To whom the duty is owed 356
  - 2) Types of Administrative Agents 357
    - a) Employers, trade unions, and directors 357
    - b) Actuaries 359
    - c) Custodians and trustees 362
    - d) Investment advisors and managers 368
    - e) Employee investment consultants 368
    - f) Lawyers 370
- D. Specific Issues in Plan Administration 371**
- 1) Plan Expenses and Costs 371
    - a) Introduction 371
    - b) Statutory requirements 372
    - c) Expenses must be reasonable 373
    - d) Payment for legal advice and costs 374
    - e) Charging fees to employees 375
  - 2) Privacy 376
    - a) Introduction 376
    - b) Relevance to pension administration 377
    - c) Private sector legislation 377
    - d) Public sector legislation 378
    - e) Statutory definitions 379
    - f) Employee consent 381
    - g) Duty of confidence and confidentiality 382
    - h) Agents and third-parties 383

**CHAPTER 7:  
FUNDING 384**

**A. Introduction 384**

**B. Contributions 385**

- 1) Introduction 385
- 2) Plan Design Requirements 386
  - a) Introduction 386
  - b) MEPP and JSPP rules 386

c)	Interest	387
2)	Employee Contributions	388
a)	Contributory or non-contributory	388
b)	<i>Income Tax Act</i> limitations	388
c)	Must be remitted by employer	389
d)	Suspension of employee contributions	389
3)	Employer Contributions	390
a)	Introduction	390
b)	Regulatory requirements	390
4)	Administrator Responsibilities	391
a)	Introduction	391
b)	MEPP rules	392
c)	Enforcement	393
5)	Custodian Responsibilities	394
a)	Introduction	394
b)	Duty to notify	394
6)	Statutory Deemed Trust	395
a)	Introduction	395
b)	Application	395
c)	Limitations	396
7)	Contributions During Employer Financial Hardship	399
a)	Introduction	399
b)	Regulatory concerns	399
c)	<i>St. Marys Paper</i>	400
d)	Current state of the law	401
8)	Contribution Holidays	404
a)	Introduction	404
b)	Policy considerations	404
c)	Defined benefit plans only	405
d)	Regulatory requirements	405
e)	<i>Income Tax Act</i> rules	406
f)	Interpretative principles	406
g)	Application of principles	408
h)	Employee contribution holidays	410
i)	Role of the administrator and employer	410
<b>C. Valuation 411</b>		
1)	Introduction	411
2)	Definitions	411
a)	Solvency terms	412
b)	Going-concern terms	413
c)	Normal cost	413
d)	Special payments	413
3)	Actuarial Valuation Reports	413
a)	Introduction	413
b)	Periodicity	414

- c) Content 415
- d) Plan amendment 416
- 4) Solvency and Going-Concern Funding 416
  - a) Introduction 416
  - b) Amortization of solvency deficiency 417
  - c) Amortization of going-concern unfunded liability 418
  - d) MEPP and JSPP rules 418
  - e) Proposals for reform 419

**D. Investment 420**

- 1) Introduction 420
- 2) Formal Requirements 421
  - a) Who may invest the pension fund 421
  - b) Formal regulatory requirements 422
  - c) Statement of investment policies and procedures (SIP&P) 423
- 3) Federal Investment Rules 425
  - a) Introduction 425
  - b) Registration of investments 425
  - c) The 10 percent rule 426
  - d) Additional quantity restrictions 427
  - e) Self-dealing rules and related party transactions 427
  - f) Other FIR investment exceptions 428
- 4) *Income Tax Act* Investment Rules 428
  - a) Introduction 428
  - b) Generally 429
  - c) Exceptions 429
  - d) Foreign property holdings 430
- 5) Standard of Care 430
  - a) Introduction 430
  - b) OSFI Investment Guideline 431
  - c) Socially responsible investing 432
- 6) Audit and Accounting 433
  - a) Introduction 433
  - b) Financial statements 434
  - c) Auditor reports 434
  - d) CICA Handbook 434

CHAPTER 8:  
AMENDMENT 437

**A. Introduction 437**

**B. Plan Amendment 438**

- 1) Introduction 438
- 2) Formal Statutory Criteria 439
  - a) Introduction 439

- b) Application for registration 439
    - c) Notice of registration 439
    - d) Refusal or revocation of registration 440
    - e) Administrator's duties 440
  - 3) Employee Notice 441
    - a) Introduction 441
    - b) Adverse amendments 442
  - 4) Void and Invalid Amendments 444
    - a) Introduction 444
    - b) No reduction of accrued benefits 444
    - c) Common law limitations 446
    - d) Surplus reversion amendments 447
    - e) Other trust law limitations 451
    - f) The "good faith" principle 452
    - g) Contractual limitations 455
    - h) Collective bargaining limitations 456
  - 5) Specific Amendments 457
    - a) Conversions to defined contribution arrangements 457
    - b) Contribution holiday amendments 461
    - c) Administrative expenses 462
- C. Reorganization 466**
- 1) Overview 466
    - a) Introduction 466
    - b) Types of business transactions 467
    - c) Share purchase transactions 467
    - d) Corporate mergers and amalgamations 468
    - e) Asset purchase transactions 469
    - f) Reorganization following a transaction 470
    - g) Public sector transactions 470
  - 2) Successor Employer Arrangements 470
    - a) Introduction 470
    - b) Application of the successor employer rule 471
    - c) Nature of the employee protections 471
    - d) Purchase and sale of a business scenarios 472
    - e) Buyer provides no pension plan 473
    - f) Buyer assumes responsibility for future service accruals only 474
    - g) Buyer assumes responsibility for seller's pension plan 476
    - h) Buyer agrees to a transfer of assets from seller's plan 477
    - i) Collective bargaining considerations 477
  - 3) Successor Pension Arrangements 478
    - a) Introduction 478
    - b) Nature of the employee protections 479
    - c) Successor pension plan need not be a newly created plan 480
    - d) Predecessor pension plan is deemed to continue 481
    - e) MEPP exceptions 484

- 4) Plan Mergers and Asset Transfers 485
  - a) Introduction 485
  - b) Contrasting a plan merger with an asset transfer 486
  - c) Regulatory consent required 487
  - d) Must protect the pension benefits and any other benefits 488
  - e) MEPP considerations 490
  - f) How much needs to be transferred 491
  - g) Employee notice 493
  - h) Common law limitations on plan mergers 494
  - i) Residual seller liability following a transfer 498
  - j) Tracing pension trust assets following a transfer 500

CHAPTER 9:

WIND UP 502

**A. Introduction 502**

- 1) Overview 502
  - a) Introduction 502
  - b) Definition of “wind up” 503

**B. Initiation of Wind up 504**

- 1) Who May Initiate a Wind up 504
  - a) Employer-initiated wind-up 504
  - b) Administrator-initiated wind-up 505
  - c) Superintendent-initiated wind-up 505
  - d) Scope of the Superintendent’s duty and discretion 507
  - e) Employee-initiated wind-up 510
- 2) Partial Wind-up 510
  - a) Introduction 510
  - b) Same rights and benefits as on full wind-up 511
  - c) Guiding principles 512
  - d) Downsizings and reorganizations of the business 513
  - e) Discontinuance of the business at a specified location 517
  - f) Successor pension plan 518
  - g) Commencement and end dates 518
  - h) Definition of the partial wind-up group 519

**C. Rights and Duties on Wind Up 522**

- 1) Introduction 522
- 2) Administrator Obligations 522
  - a) Introduction 522
  - b) Statutory standard of care 522
  - c) Appointment of new administrator 524
  - d) Wind up date 525
  - e) Wind up notice 526

- f) Wind up report 528
- g) Wind up statement 530
- h) Wind up conclusion 531
- 3) Employee Rights 531
  - a) Introduction 531
  - b) Accrual 532
  - c) Vesting 533
  - d) Locking-in 533
  - e) Portability 533
  - f) Grow-ins 534
  - g) Bridging benefits 536
  - h) Commuted value 537
  - i) Surplus distribution 537
  - j) Multi-jurisdictional pension plans 539
- 4) Employer Funding Obligations 541
  - a) Introduction 541
  - b) Payment of contributions due 541
  - c) Pension plan has a wind up surplus 542
  - d) Employer is solvent and plan has a wind up deficiency 542
  - e) Employer is insolvent and plan has a wind up deficiency 544
  - f) MEPP and JSPP exceptions 545
- 5) Pension Benefits Guarantee Fund 546
  - a) Introduction 546
  - b) Administration 548
  - c) Assessment 548
  - d) Excluded and qualifying plans 549
  - e) Application 550
  - f) Process 550
  - g) Coverage 550
  - h) Lien and charge 551

## CHAPTER 10:

### SURPLUS 552

#### A. Introduction 552

- 1) Overview 552
  - a) Background 552
  - b) What is surplus 555
  - c) How and why surplus arises 556
  - d) When surplus exists 557
  - e) “Actuarial” and “actual” surplus 558
- 2) Policy Considerations 560
  - a) Introduction 560
  - b) Employer and employee perspectives 560
  - c) Judicial and legislative perspectives 562

- d) Policy conclusions in perspective 564
- B. Statutory Framework 566**
  - 1) Introduction 566
    - a) Early statutory approach 566
    - b) Post-reform rules 1987–91 568
    - c) Surplus sharing regulation 570
  - 2) Formal Requirements for Withdrawal by Employer 572
    - a) Introduction 572
    - b) Plan design requirements 572
    - c) Regulatory consent required 573
    - d) Employer must make the application 574
    - e) Administrator responsibilities 574
    - f) Distributions to employees 575
    - g) Superintendent's decision 576
  - 3) Criteria for Consenting to Withdrawal Applications 576
    - a) Introduction 576
    - b) Plan must have a surplus 576
    - c) Pension liabilities must be secured 577
    - d) Surplus notice 577
    - e) Employee consent 579
    - f) Employer must be entitled to surplus 582
    - g) Allocation and payment of surplus shares 583
  - 4) Surplus Distribution Rules in Other Jurisdictions 586
    - a) Introduction 586
    - b) Surplus sharing rules 586
    - c) Dispute settlement mechanisms 587
- C. Surplus Ownership 588**
  - 1) Introduction 588
    - a) Timing considerations 588
    - b) Judicial considerations 590
  - 2) Pension Trust or Pension Contract 592
    - a) Introduction 592
    - b) Intention to create a trust 593
    - c) Statutes and municipal bylaws 594
    - d) Interpretation of a pension contract 594
    - e) Pension brochures and booklets 595
  - 3) Interpretation of a Pension Trust 596
    - a) Introduction 596
    - b) General interpretative principles 597
    - c) Specific interpretative principles 597
    - d) Application of the general rule 599
    - e) Employer is a beneficiary from the outset 600
    - f) Employer has exempted the surplus from the trust 601
    - g) Employer has reserved the power to revoke the trust 603

- h) Resulting trust 605
- 4) Table of Surplus Ownership Cases 606
  - a) Employees own the surplus 606
  - b) Employers owns the surplus 607

TABLE OF CASES 611

INDEX 637

ABOUT THE AUTHOR 657